



ISO/IEC JTC 1 N6964

2002-11-19

Replaces:

ISO/IEC JTC 1 Information Technology

Document Type: Summary of Voting/Table of Replies

Document Title: Summary of Voting for JTC 1 N 6818: Text of ISO/IEC DTR 9573-11, Second Edition, Structure Description and Style Specifications for Standards Document Interchange

Document Source: JTC 1 Secretariat

Project Number:

Document Status: This document has passed JTC 1 review. SC 34 is requested to review the comments and prepare a revised text.

Action ID: FYI

Due Date:

Distribution:

Medium:

Disk Serial No:

No. of Pages: 4

Committee : **JTC 1 - Information Technology**

Ballot **JTC 1 N6818**

Number :

Ballot Title : **Text of ISO/IEC DTR 9573-11 2nd edition, Structure Descriptions and Style Specifications for Standards Document Interchange**

Source: ANSI

Distribution: JTC 1 membership

Questions for this Ballot		
	Answers	Votes
Does your National Body support DTR 9573-11 2nd edition to go forward for publication?		
	Not Yet Voted	8
	Approve as presented	11
	Approve with comments	1
	Disapprove for the reasons attached	1
	abstain	7
Organization	Q.1	Comment
Australia	abstain	
Belgium	Not Yet Voted	
Brazil	Not Yet Voted	
Canada	Approve as presented	
China	Approve as presented	
Czech Republic	Approve as presented	
Democratic People's Republic of Korea	Not Yet Voted	
Denmark	abstain	
Egypt	Not Yet Voted	

Finland	Approve as presented	
France	abstain	
Germany	abstain	
Hungary	Not Yet Voted	
Ireland	Approve as presented	
Italy	Approve as presented	
Japan	Approve with comments	Annex C should include a documented-oriented profile.
Netherlands	Approve as presented	
New Zealand	Approve as presented	
Norway	Approve as presented	
Portugal	Not Yet Voted	
Republic of Korea	Approve as presented	
Romania	Not Yet Voted	
Slovenia	Not Yet Voted	
South Africa	abstain	No expertise or involvement locally in this area.
Sweden	abstain	
Switzerland	abstain	
United Kingdom	Disapprove for the reasons attached	(See Attached File) 3542_02656989.pdf
USA	Approve as presented	

DISC PRIVATE CIRCULATION
BSI

Doc No. 02/ 02/656989

Date 2002-10-31

C'tee Ref IST/41

Action For information

UK vote and comments on J1N6818 - ISO/IEC DTR 9573-11 (2nd edition), Structure Descriptions and Style Specifications for Standards Document Interchange

UK Vote: Disapproval for the following reasons

Technical (major)

The element names in the case-sensitive XML DTD and the XSLT stylesheet are all lowercase, whereas the headings of the clauses and all the examples show the element names in caps e.g (<STANDARD>), which is only valid for case-insensitive SGML files. All examples of coding should be changed to lowercase to ensure they can work with both versions of the DTD.

Sections 10 and 11

The text for sections 10 and 11 is incomplete.

Technical (minor)

General

As a new standard for the identification of metadata exchanged between standards organizations is being developed at present through the OASIS Standards Registry group, by the end of this year some of the ISONET <Exx.xx and the non-ISONET document profile elements could usefully be mapped to Standard Registry Element Names. If this is considered desirable by the team I would be happy to help suggest suitable mappings. Note that the Standard Registry Element Names are mapped to Dublin Core metadata fields. ISONET could be usefully extended by assigning Dublin Core identifiers to suitable fields.

Clauses 5.4.2.2, 7.7.1 and 7.8.1

5.4.2.2 states "As we decided to remove inclusions, the float components (e.g. figure, table, index entry) should be incorporated into the content model." (The removal of inclusions and exclusions makes it possible to develop an XML equivalent to the SGML DTD.)

Yet 7.7.1 states "The parameter entities fig.model, fig.include, and fig.exclude are used to specify the content model, in-clusion, and exclusions, .." and 7.8.1 has similar wording (Note the misspelling of inclusion in both paragraphs!) If these entity references are retained a note should be added to make it clear that these entities should be blank in any XML version of the DTD.

Clause 5.7.4.4

The list of notations for artwork given in 5.7.4.4 should be extended to include JPEG, JBIG and PNG ISO standards at least, with possible inclusions for GIF TIFF/IT (ISO 12639), TIFF/EP (ISO 1134-2) and IPI-IIF (ISO 12089).

<end of UK comments>